

Mark Shaw
Author
1085 Santa Clara Street, #7
Santa Clara, CA 95050
www.markshawbooks.com
mshawin@yahoo.com
415.940.0827

January 14, 2020

Mr. Dermot F. Shea
Police Commissioner
New York City Police Department
1 Police Plaza
New York, NY 10038

Re: New Evidence Regarding Main Suspect Requires Cold Case Squad Investigation of Media Icon Dorothy Kilgallen's Death in 1965; Otherwise Killer will go Free;

Dear Commissioner Shea,

Since the New York Police Department and its Cold Case Squad, led now by Chief of Detectives Rodney Harrison, are the guardians of justice for victims of crimes not yet solved, it is important that private citizens like me make you aware when these victims are denied the justice they deserve. This is important even if the crime, in this case a homicide, took place more than 50 years ago since the victim has certain rights, including a thorough investigation of their case, regardless of the time lapse especially when the victim was denied justice despite there being mysterious circumstances surrounding the person's death.

The question of justice denied is even more important when the main suspect of the crime is still alive despite mountains of evidence, including additional incriminating evidence discovered within the last few months, pointing to his guilt, and that suspect has never even been interviewed regarding his complicity in the victim's death. The disturbing result is that the main suspect may very well get away with murder unless swift action is taken by the Cold Case Squad, which in this case is the proper investigatory agency due its ability to interview the main suspect and other witnesses still alive, having full access to NYPD documents, records, etc. connected to the homicide from the 1960s and subpoena power to retrieve others of importance.

The crime I speak of involves the November 1965 death at the age of 52 of the courageous American patriot and revered historical figure Dorothy Kilgallen, best known for being the star panelist on the long running CBS television program, *What's My Line?*, but whose reputation as a legendary investigative reporter resulted in Ms. Kilgallen being a media icon like few before or

since. In fact, it was her dogged 18-month investigation of the JFK assassination to discover the truth about what happened to her friend, the president, that ultimately put her in peril and cost Kilgallen her life in the line of duty.



Details of Ms. Kilgallen’s life and times, her JFK assassination investigation (she was present at the Jack Ruby trial and the only reporter to interview him among other accomplishments) and her death, are chronicled in two books of mine, the bestselling “The Reporter Who Knew Too Much: The Mysterious Death of What’s My Line TV Star and Media Icon Dorothy Kilgallen,” [TRWKTM] published in late 2016, and “Denial of Justice: Dorothy Kilgallen, Abuse of Power and the Most Compelling JFK Assassination Investigation in History,” [DOJ] released in November 2018. A copy of the paperback version of the latter, my 25th publication, is enclosed for your interest. More about me may be learned at www.markshawbooks.com.

Additional information about Kilgallen whose inspiring, yet tragic story, has touched the emotions of readers around the world, including videotaped interviews with those who are important witnesses to her demise may be learned at www.thedorothykilgallenstory.org A presentation I gave about her case at the Commonwealth Club of San Francisco in December, 2018 is available on YouTube at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9vUA4TSYLlI>.

To date, more than 100,000 people have watched this video and another presentation I provided about TRWKTM when it was released. On November 14, 2019, I gave an updated presentation about Kilgallen’s story at a prestigious library near Dallas, Texas. Here is the link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VYDaqto22NY> An additional presentation was then provided by me at the Festival of Politics in Dublin, Ireland on November 22, 2019, the 56th anniversary of President Kennedy’s death in honor of Kilgallen, whose roots connect to her great, great grandparents having resided in County Mayo (photo of them in DOJ, page 9/10). In this presentation, the evidence solidified the fact that a crack reporter with Irish heritage for all practical purposes solved the murder of a U. S. President of Irish heritage as well, evidence that destroys all notions of the distortions of history pervading to this day about President Kennedy’s death.

During the course of my ten-year biographical research of the life and times of the Pulitzer-Prize nominated journalist, I discovered compelling evidence proving that Ms. Kilgallen's death in 1965 was not accidental as noted later in this letter, but a homicide. Weighed and evaluated in the same manner I employed as a criminal defense lawyer and as the *USA Today*, *CNN*, and *ESPN* legal analyst for the Mike Tyson, O. J. Simpson and Kobe Bryant cases, this new evidence also points to her murder as having been effectively covered up by those involved, including strong indication, at the time of her death, through corruption at the New York City Medical Examiner's Office.

With this new evidence in mind, a fresh investigation of Kilgallen's case is judicially responsible. Even though the events surrounding her death are now five decades old, I do not believe your office's investigation will result in futile posturing. There are strong leads based on credible, primary source, witnesses and the main suspect, as mentioned, is still alive.

Called "The most powerful female voice in America" by the *New York Post* and "the greatest female writer in the world" by Ernest Hemingway, Kilgallen served as a columnist for *New York Journal-American* syndicated to 200 newspapers across the country. She also hosted a radio show listened to by millions of New Yorkers, and, most importantly, covered many of the high-profile trials of the 20th century, including the Lindbergh baby kidnapping case, the Dr. Sam Sheppard case (which became the film *The Fugitive*), and the Jack Ruby trial in Dallas.

Kilgallen was found dead at age 52 on November 8, 1965 in her Manhattan townhouse with the NYC Medical Examiner's Office concluding she died as a result of "Acute Ethanol and Barbiturate Intoxication: Circumstances Undetermined." Despite apparent evidence to the contrary, including a staged death scene and witnesses whose testimony was relevant to an alternative conclusion and who should have been interviewed at the time, no investigation took place by the NYPD.

In fact, significant indications of boldface negligence not only by the Medial Examiner's office but the NYPD at the time included stating Kilgallen's full name on the Certificate of Death (enclosed) as "Dorothy Killgallen Kollmar" when her name was, in fact, Dorothy Mae Kilgallen. Those who prepared this document also mistakenly spelled Kilgallen name wrong as "Killgallen" while mistakenly recording her birthdate as July 13, 1913 when in fact she was born on July 3, 1913.

This said, highly credible evidence about Kilgallen's case for Cold Case Squad consideration, in addition to that in DOJ, includes the following:

- Proof, as noted, that Kilgallen was conducting an 18-month investigation into the JFK and Oswald assassinations with the intention of publishing a "tell-all" book for Random House;
- Based on her research, Kilgallen had written NYJA articles and columns criticizing FBI Director J. Edgar Hoover's "Oswald Alone" theory, including one entitled "The Oswald File Must Not Close" where she wrote, "Justice is a big rug; when you pull it out from

under one man, a lot of others fall too,” causing Hoover to become Kilgallen’s enemy and have motive to silence her;

- More than 40 interviews with those who knew Killgallen best, including her two closest friends, hairdressers Marc Sinclair and Charles Simpson, Katherine Stone (one of the last people to see Kilgallen alive), and Joe Tonahill (Jack Ruby’s co-counsel)—each of whom adds critical information to how and why Kilgallen died including:
 - Videotaped testimony by Sinclair stating Kilgallen was “scared for her life and her family” and that she had bought a gun and changed her will shortly before she died:
 - Videotaped testimony by Simpson, a second hairdresser and friend stating Kilgallen told him, “If the wrong people knew what I know, it would cost me my life and she was dead shortly thereafter.”
 - Evidence in a videotaped interview from Sinclair stating that he found Kilgallen’s body in a bedroom she never slept in with her eyelashes, make-up and hairpiece in place wearing bedclothes she never wore to bed leading to the logical conclusion that this was a staged death scene. Missing was Kilgallen’s JFK assassination investigation file which contained all of her notes about the president’s death, including those from her interviews with Jack Ruby at his trial. It has never been found.
- Forensic tests proving the New York Medical Examiner’s official report to the public and the media that Kilgallen accidentally died of the barbiturate and alcohol combination deliberately concealed the presence of not one, but two additional barbiturates in Kilgallen’s system and that further tests in 1968 proved there were actually three barbiturates, Seconal, Tuinal, and Nembutal in her system and that the dangerous drugs had been administered in powder form blunting any conception that she died accidentally;
- Primary source statements by three witnesses available for interview proving that the New York Medical Examiner’s Brooklyn Branch, which inexplicably responded instead of the Manhattan Branch, to Kilgallen’s Manhattan townhouse when she died, was controlled by the Mafia and provided faulty ME Reports on occasion;
- Never-before-reported evidence from primary witnesses proving that two toxicologists in the ME Brooklyn Branch deliberately withheld evidence that would have launched a new investigation of Kilgallen’s death three years after she died;
- Evidence showing the Medical Examiner’s report—including the mysterious words, “Circumstances Undetermined” added a few days following Kilgallen’s death and suggesting confusion about how she may have died—led to no investigation then or any time in the future;

- Further evidence from the ME stating that he “would not speculate about the form in which Miss Kilgallen had taken the barbiturates” telling reporters, “We’d rather leave that up in the air. We don’t want to give that out—well, just because . . .” followed by no investigation.
- Recently, a witness available for interview has confirmed that Kilgallen’s pharmacist in the Hamptons indicated that he was surprised when reports indicated she died of a drug overdose since she was “clean,” even to the point of not ordering refills of Seconal.

[The enclosed book bolsters this evidence, along with copies of Ms. Kilgallen’s articles, columns, photos, and several of the videotaped interviews all available at www.thedorothykilgallenstory.org I have also enclosed Ms. Kilgallen’s Autopsy Report with commentary from DOJ.

Regarding the main suspect in Kilgallen’s murder, former journalist and Kilgallen confidant Ron Pataky, still alive today (84 years old) and living in Columbus, Ohio, his complicity in her death is chronicled in DOJ. It includes:

1. Pataky’s admissions to two close relatives (still alive and available for interview) of his being *the last person* to see Kilgallen alive, apparently by meeting her at the Regency Hotel bar a few blocks from her East 68th Street townhouse during the wee hours of November 8, 1965, and then accompanying her to her townhouse hours before Kilgallen was found dead;
2. Pataky said he was not in New York City at the time of Kilgallen’s death, but his account of this happening does not hold up. He asserted, among other accounts, that “a fashion editor named Jane Horrocks” read the sad news of Kilgallen’s death from the newspaper newswire to him at his newspaper office in Columbus, Ohio, but Horrocks denied this account stating, “At the time of [Kilgallen’s] death I was covering fashion showings in California”;
3. Pataky lied about not being in New York City “until two or three weeks after she died,” with the truth being that *four days* after failing to attend Kilgallen’s funeral on the 11th of November, 1965, he actually partied in the city. When confronted with his apparent lie, he exclaimed, “What did I do . . . hire my own jet, fly [to New York], kill her, and then fly back in a hurry?” without having been accused of wrongdoing;
4. Disturbing facts regarding Pataky’s background include arrests for drunk and disorderly conduct, a domestic altercation with a celebrity female companion who called him “violent and nutsy,” an incident where he fired a .38 caliber pistol four times at Jim Otis, an ex-NFL player available for interview during an altercation while threatening him with

a blackjack, drunken driving, and his own admission that he attended an “assassin’s school” in Central America prior to meeting Kilgallen;

5. Despite Pataky being the only one Kilgallen trusted with her JFK assassination research and the conclusions she had reached about who killed the president which were about to be revealed in a “tell-all” book she was writing for Random House, Pataky at first denied that Kilgallen had confided in him. He then admitted she had shared secret information, especially about Jack Ruby, the assassin of Lee Harvey Oswald, causing Pataky to be extremely vulnerable to Kilgallen’s enemies who were determined not to let her write that book;
6. When parts of Kilgallen’s investigation began leaking to what she called “the wrong people,” she suspected Pataky was the one who had betrayed her according to statements by Marc Sinclair. Research indicates Pataky may have well been a “plant” inserted into Kilgallen’s life shortly after the Ruby trial she attended by her enemies, including underworld figures Pataky admitting being “friends” with at the time. He thus faced exposure by Kilgallen as a snitch, which would have destroyed his journalism career, providing one motive for silencing the courageous reporter, the most extreme form of censorship;
7. Multiple inconsistent accounts by Pataky and outright lies concerning his relationship with Kilgallen during the last months of her life exist by a man whose actions through the years indicate he was an alcoholic and a psychopath with pathological tendencies;
8. Most importantly, Pataky wrote two poems he admitted to relatives who may be interviewed were about Kilgallen, one of which clearly details the most plausible manner by which she was poisoned, either at the Regency Hotel bar in Manhattan where he met her hours before her death or at her townhouse, with not one but three barbiturates (Seconal, Tuinal, and Nembutal). This shocking poem contains *facts only the killer could know* since they were never released to the public. A close reading without question implicates Pataky in Kilgallen’s death;

Vodka Roulette Seen As Relief Possibility



While I'm spilling my guts
She is driving me nuts
Please fetch us two drinks
On the run
Just skip all the noise'n
Make one of 'em poison
And don't even tell me
Which one!

© 2006 - Dr. Ron Pataky
Castore-Ransom-Notes.com

If this evidence were not enough to warrant investigation of Pataky, this urgent request for an investigation is based on new, compelling evidence discovered a few months ago by a credible, Las Vegas primary source available for interview who knew firsthand the workings of the underworld, the CIA, and the FBI during the 1960s. This evidence includes statements by this credible witness that Pataky had landed “in some kind of trouble” within months of Kilgallen’s death and was “saved” from the “trouble” by rogue government agents, apparently working for the CIA and/or FBI, who were closely monitoring Kilgallen’s JFK assassination investigation and her intention to publish the “tell-all” book for Random House “naming names” as to who killed the president and why.



According to the source, Pataky, in exchange for being “saved,” agreed to be “recruited” and then “managed” by the government agency to the extent of agreeing to tell the rogue agents what secret information Kilgallen had “tripped on to” that was lethal in nature. When he betrayed his lover by “squealing” on her with the “damaging” evidence proving that the government agency was definitely involved in the assassination along with one particular Mafioso, Carlos Marcello whom Kilgallen had connected to Lee Harvey Oswald and Jack Ruby, the source said this sealed Kilgallen’s fate, that she was about to be “dead.” This evidence squares up with statements made by Kilgallen’s butler’s daughter, Brenda DeJourdan (still alive today and available for interview) who describes FBI agents or those posing as FBI agents swarming Kilgallen’s townhouse shortly after she died and confiscating all of her documents which had to have included her JFK assassination investigation evidence file).

Such evidence added to that already pointing to Pataky’s involvement in Kilgallen’s demise and coincides with a firsthand account by Pataky 1990s close friend Camile Renoir, also available for interview: “You know, maybe Ron didn’t know they were going to murder Kilgallen, just scare her. Ron looked out for Ron, first and foremost and I don’t believe he could actually kill someone unless, that is, his life was in danger. He’d be afraid to kill, but if pressured, perhaps by Mafia or other dangerous guys, I can see him doing it.”

With all of this information to consider, I believe your Cold Case Squad will be most interested in information provided by retired Dutchess County Sheriff’s Office (Poughkeepsie) Detective Dennis O’Keeffe (still alive and able to be interviewed). He forwarded information about an NYPD detective he knew as Jack “Popeye” Doyle who, along with Detective Mike Ward had arrived at Kilgallen’s townhouse on the day she died. O’Keeffe reported that “Jack Doyle called me before I retired and said a retired professor had tried to get a hold of him.” Doyle then added, ‘I was a young detective and responded to the death of Dorothy Kilgallen. I filled out “the death report,” a “DD-5” form. It also contained all of my interview notes.’

Apparently, the DD-5 [Detective Division-5], revealed to exist for the first time in DOJ, suggested a different cause of the death than it being accidental - visceral congestion. It is a classic symptom of drug overdoses culminating in a bloody froth emanating from the victim’s nose and mouth.

Doyle had reported, “All I got from the ME’s office was a slip of paper saying “death due to visceral congestion.” No more detailed report than that. If there was any cover-up on this whatsoever, it would have been down at the ME’s office.” He added, “They never went into detail. Had it been explained to me that there was an overly amount of barbiturates in the system

then I probably would have dug a little deeper. There was no indication at all that there was anything out of the ordinary.” A Medical Examiner's Office report signed by Dr. James Luke stated, ‘Visceral congestion is not a term I would use and it was not the cause of death.’”

Doyle thus dead-ended any investigation of Kilgallen’s death before it started. He connected a “empty Seconal vile” found on a bedside table in Kilgallen’s bedroom with “drug overdose” and, in all likelihood decided this was just another example of a celebrity who couldn’t handle life in the fast lane and took her own life. With this mindset in tow, he apparently never asked questions of Kilgallen’s relatives, her butler James Clement and his wife, Kilgallen’s friends, or her colleagues at *What’s My Line?*, no one. Doyle did not even go so far as to attempt an investigation of Kilgallen’s whereabouts on the evening before her death or during the early morning hours before her body was discovered. This meant he had no idea of her behavior during her final *What’s My Line?* program, at P. J. Clarke’s, the Regency Hotel bar, or during the time she left that bar and returned home. Certainly, he never attempted to discover who the “mystery man” was who met Kilgallen at the bar, meaning Pataky. To not do so was incompetent unless Detective Doyle was instructed by others to simply go through the motions thus blunting any chance of gathering real evidence regarding Kilgallen’s death.

Doyle’s disregard for any investigation is more troublesome based on what Brenda DeJourdan’s father told her happened on the day Kilgallen died. She explained to this author, “I remember my father saying something about a policeman mentioning the word ‘homicide.’ Dad told the police he heard something; somebody could have come in the townhouse. Dad asked, ‘don’t you want to investigate?’” They said, ‘no.’”

Curiously, within a month of Kilgallen’s death, Detective Doyle, the father of six children, resigned without a pension from the police force. He left New York City and opened Doyle’s Terrace Restaurant near LaGrangeville, New York near the apple picking country. Describing a brief interview with Doyle, a trim blue-eyed man at the time who favored polyester suits, researcher Kathryn Fauble told me, “He sounded to us like a tough guy from Brooklyn—Goodfellas style.”

Asked his opinion of the Kilgallen case, O’Keeffe told me;

Based on totality of the evidence and circumstances I know about case; this should have been a murder investigation. It could have been that the authorities were just as scared to investigate as Kilgallen’s family, people close to the family, WML? colleagues, journalists, whoever, were to come forward and that is why there was no investigation in 1965.

Regarding Pataky, O’Keeffe added,

It appears to me that Ron Pataky has dirty hands regarding Kilgallen’s death.

As noted, your Cold Case Squad is the most logical agency to investigate due to access to records, documents, etc. connected to the Kilgallen case, including:

The “Supplementary Complaint Report” on Kilgallen's death dated Nov. 8 or Nov. 9, 1965, signed by NYPD homicide detective Peter McPartland;

New York police reports on Kilgallen's death issued by the NYPD Public Information Division headed in the 1970s by Commander Gertrude Schimmel;

A 1965 “DD 5 Supplementary Complaint Report,” also known as a “Request of Cause of Death,” sent by either the New York Medical Examiner's Office or the NYPD.

With this evidence in mind, while speaking to Detective O’Keeffe, and certainly interviewing witnesses still alive as noted, and, as a first priority interviewing Ron Pataky, hopefully a thorough search of NYPD files will result in discovering not only the DD-5 forms but additional documents relating to Kilgallen’s death. There may be even an outside chance of discovering her JFK assassination investigation file which would be an historical discovery next to none. Certainly, your squad may also request any FBI files relating to Kilgallen’s death.

Commissioner Shea, I realize your Cold Case division, which you headed up before being appointed Commissioner, may have cases with more priority due to the time factor with Kilgallen’s case, but murder is murder and here we have the murder of a brave woman who attempted to learn the truth about one of the most important events in history, the JFK assassination as chronicled in DOJ. Your reputation is that of a man with a true passion for justice I thus hope that you and your team of investigators will read DOJ, and carefully examine all of the evidence included here and in the enclosed document I have updated for your interest, an “Evidence Availability Report” which includes contact information for witnesses to be interviewed as well as Pataky’s contact information. If you do, I believe you will understand why I am fighting for this remarkable woman with a determination to see that she gets her “day in court,” so to speak, and that she receives the justice she deserves hopefully through the appointment of an independent prosecutor or the convening of a Grand Jury after the case is fully investigated.

I’m certain you will have questions but please keep in mind that the evidence strongly suggesting Kilgallen was the victim of foul play is based on primary sources and that with witnesses still alive, the opportunity exists to right a wrong committed so long ago even to the possible extent of locating her missing JFK assassination investigation file which could have been confiscated

by the NYPD or the FBI. Doing so could change the course of history regarding what really happened in November 1963 when the world was forever changed by the senseless death of a true patriot like Kilgallen, President John F. Kennedy.

I appreciate the consideration and look forward to hearing that a full-scale investigation of Kilgallen's death will be conducted sooner than later. I promise to cooperate on my end including my visiting your offices in New York City if requested to do so.

Please acknowledge receipt of this letter and enclosures.

Sincerely,

Mark Shaw

P. S. You may be aware that in early 2017, the NY District Attorney's office agreed to conduct a thorough investigation of Dorothy Kilgallen's death. Unfortunately, those in charge cut short the investigation as chronicled in "Denial of Justice" without, among other matters, ever interviewing Ron Pataky. In addition, the new evidence included with this letter was not available to the DA's investigator or the ADA assigned to the case.

Enclosures:

- "Denial of Justice"
- Dorothy Kilgallen case Evidence Report
- Dorothy Kilgallen Death Certificate
- Dorothy Kilgallen Autopsy Report and Commentary from "Denial of Justice"